



International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda  
Tribunal pénal international pour le Rwanda

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

## TRIAL CHAMBER I

**Before:**

Judge Erik Møse, Presiding  
Judge Asoka de Zoysa Gunawardana  
Judge Mehmet Güney

**Registry:** Mr Adama Dieng

**Decision of:** 7 June 2001

**THE PROSECUTOR**  
**Versus**  
**IGNACE BAGILISHEMA**

**ICTR-95-1A-T**

---

**JUDGEMENT**

---

**The Office of Prosecutor:**

Ms Jane Anywar Adong  
Mr Charles Adeogun-Phillips  
Mr Wallace Kapaya  
Ms Boi-Tia Stevens

**Counsel for the Defence:**

Mr François Roux  
Mr Maroufa Diabira  
Ms Héleyn Uñac  
Mr Wayne Jordash

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### CHAPTER I. INTRODUCTION

1. The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
2. Indictment
3. Jurisdiction of the Tribunal
4. The Accused

### CHAPTER II. PROCEEDINGS

1. Procedural Background
2. Evidentiary Matters

### CHAPTER III. APPLICABLE LAW

1. Individual Criminal Responsibility
  - 1.1 Responsibility under Article 6(1) of the Statute
  - 1.2 Responsibility under Article 6(3) of the Statute
    - 1.2.1 Superior-Subordinate Relationship
    - 1.2.2 Knowing or Having Reason to Know
    - 1.2.3 Failing to Prevent or Punish
2. The Crime of Genocide (Article 2 of the Statute)
  - 2.1 Genocide
    - 2.1.1 Underlying Acts
    - 2.1.2 Dolus Specialis
  - 2.2 Complicity to Commit Genocide
3. Crimes against Humanity (Article 3 of the Statute)
  - 3.1 The Broader Attack
    - 3.1.1 Widespread or Systematic
    - 3.1.2 Against any Civilian Population
    - 3.1.3 On Discriminatory Grounds
  - 3.2 Underlying Acts
  - 3.3 Mental Element
4. Violations of the Geneva Conventions and Additional Protocol II
  - 4.1 Applicability

4.2 Material Requirements

5. Cumulative Charging

CHAPTER IV. GENERAL ISSUES

1. Introductory Remarks

2. Character of the Accused prior to the Events in 1994

3. Decision of the Accused to remain in his Post of Bourgmestre

3.1 Introduction

3.2 Significance of the Decision

3.3 Conclusion

4. Possible Subordinates of the Accused

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Communal Staff

4.3 Communal Police

4.4 Gendarmerie Nationale

4.5 Reservists

4.6 *Interahamwe*

4.7 *Abakiga*.

5. Measures taken by the Accused to Prevent Crimes

5.1 Introduction

5.2 Powers and Resources of the Accused

5.3 Prevention of Crimes by the Accused

5.4 Meetings

6. The Accused's Relationship with Célestin Semanza

7. Letter of 24 June 1994

8. Conclusions

CHAPTER V. FACTUAL AND LEGAL FINDINGS SPECIFIC EVENTS

1. Introduction

2. Events between 6 and 12 April 1994

2.1 Attacks in Mabanza *Commune*

2.2 Attacks at Nyububare Hill

- 2.3 Night Patrols
- 2.4 Security Meeting on 9 April 1994
- 2.5 Refugees fleeing to Mabanza Communal Office
- 2.6 Meeting between the Accused and the Prefect on 12 April 1994

### **3. Events in Kibuye Town from 13 to 19 April 1994**

- 3.1 [Movement of Refugees from Mabanza Communal Office to Kibuye Town](#)
- 3.2 [Detention and Maltreatment of Refugees at Gatwaro Stadium, Kibuye Town, April 1994](#)
  - 3.2.1 Introduction
  - 3.2.2 A Preconceived Plan?
  - 3.2.3 Description of Gatwaro Stadium
  - 3.2.4 Conditions at the Stadium – Deliberations
  - 3.2.5 Conditions at the Stadium – General Findings
    - (i) Were the Refugees detained at the Stadium?
    - (ii) The Treatment of the Refugees
    - (iii) Was the Maltreatment Inflicted upon the Refugees such as to Reach the Legal Threshold of “Inhumane Acts”?
  - 3.2.6 Was the Accused Present at the Stadium 13-17 April 1994? - Deliberations
    - Wednesday 13 April 1994
    - Thursday 14 April 1994
    - Friday 15 April 1994
    - Saturday 16 April 1994
    - Sunday 17 April 1994
  - 3.2.7 Findings on the Accused’s Responsibility
    - (i) General Observations
    - (ii) Presence of the Accused on Wednesday 13 April 1994
    - (iii) Presence of the Accused on Thursday 14 April 1994
    - (iv) Conclusion
- 3.3 [Attack on Refugees at Home St. Jean Complex, Kibuye Town, 17 April 1994](#)

3.3.1 Introduction

3.3.2 Deliberations

3.3.3 Findings

3.4 [Attack on Refugees at Gatwaro Stadium, Kibuye Town, 18-19 April 1994](#)

3.4.1 Introduction

3.4.2 Deliberations

3.4.3 Findings on the Accused's Responsibility

(i) General observations

(ii) Presence of Accused at the Stadium on 18 April 1994

Witness AA

Witness A

Witness G

(iii) Conclusion

3.4.4 Conclusions

(i) Cumulative effect of evidence

(ii) Summary of findings in relation to Paragraphs 4.21-4 of the Indictment

(iii) Further grounds of liability

4. [Events in Mabanza Commune from 13 April to July 1994](#)

4.1 Killing of Karungu

4.2 Killing of Pastor Muganga

4.3 Killing of Refugees at Communal Office; Burial in Mass Grave

4.4 Attacks at Bisesero

4.5 Killing of Kanyabugosi

4.6 Killing of the Sons of Witness B

4.7 Killing of Tutsi concealed at the House of Habayo

4.8 The Detention and Fate of Habayo

5. [Roadblocks in Mabanza Commune](#)

5.1 Introduction

5.2 General Observations on Roadblocks

- 5.2.1 Roadblocks and the Civil Defence Program
- 5.2.2 Roadblocks Sighted in Mabanza Commune
- 5.3 Liability for Roadblock-Related Crimes
  - 5.3.1 Liability under Articles 6(1) and 6(3) of the Statute
  - 5.3.2 Distinction between “Official” and “Unofficial” Roadblocks
- 5.4 Trafipro Roadblock – Establishment and Purpose
  - 5.4.1 Setting up and Staffing of Trafipro Roadblock
  - 5.4.2 Purpose of Trafipro Roadblock
- 5.5 Trafipro Roadblock – Accused’s Complicity in Killing of Bigirimana
- 5.6 Trafipro Roadblock – Accused’s Complicity in Killing of Judith
- 5.7 Killings of Bigirimana and Judith – Accused’s Responsibility as Superior
- 5.8 Gitikinini Roadblock
- 5.9 Gacaca Roadblock
- 5.10 Roadblocks Generally – Accused’s Responsibility in Negligence
- 5.11 Conclusions

**VI. VERDICT**

**SEPARATE OPINION OF JUDGE ASOKA DE Z. GUNAWARDANA**

**SEPARATE AND DISSENTING OPINION OF JUDGE MEHMET GÜNEY**

**ANNEX A INDICTMENT**

**ANNEX B GLOSSARY**